

JENNER & BLOCK LLP  
Brent Caslin (SBN 198682)  
bcaslin@jenner.com  
David R. Singer (SBN 204699)  
dsinger@jenner.com  
Todd C. Toral (SBN 197706)  
ttoral@jenner.com  
Carolyn Small (SBN 304938)  
csmall@jenner.com  
Elizabeth Baldridge (SBN 313390)  
ebaldridge@jenner.com  
515 South Flower Street, Suite 3300  
Los Angeles, CA 90071-2246  
Telephone: +1 213 239 5100  
Facsimile: +1 213 239 5199  
Tel.: 213-239-5100 | Fax: 213-239-5199

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

BROWN NERI SMITH KHAN LLP  
Ethan J. Brown (SBN 218814)  
ethan@bnsklaw.com  
Patricia A. E. Tenenbaum (SBN 258916)  
patricia@bnsklaw.com  
11601 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 2080  
Los Angeles, CA 90025  
Tel.: 310-593-9890 | Fax: 310-593-9980

*Attorneys for Defendant  
James Kaminsky*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

**CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

MOVE, INC., a Delaware corporation;  
MOVE SALES, INC., a Delaware  
corporation; REALSELECT, INC., a  
Delaware corporation,

Plaintiffs,

v.

COSTAR GROUP, INC., a Delaware  
corporation; JAMES KAMINSKY, an  
individual; and DOES 1 through 10,  
inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 2:24-cv-05607-GW-BFM

**JOINT STIPULATION FOR ENTRY  
OF AN ORDER ESTABLISHING A  
PROTOCOL FOR FORENSIC  
INSPECTION OF CERTAIN  
DIGITAL MEDIA**

1 Plaintiffs Move, Inc., Move Sales, Inc., and RealSelect, Inc. (together,  
2 “Move”), and Defendant James Kaminsky (collectively, the “Parties”), by and  
3 through their counsel of record, hereby stipulate and agree as follows to this Forensic  
4 Inspection Protocol (the “Protocol”):  
5

## 6 **CUSTODY OF DIGITAL MEDIA**

7 1. The Parties confirm that this Protocol is intended to apply to the  
8 inspection of the below device and its contents (the “Kaminsky Device”). Mr.  
9 Kaminsky confirms that the Kaminsky Device listed herein, in its original and  
10 unaltered state, has been forensically imaged or preserved in accordance with  
11 appropriate practices in the industry.  
12  
13

- 14 • The forensic image made by Mr. Kaminsky’s forensic experts (“Kaminsky’s  
15 Expert”) of Mr. Kaminsky’s personal Apple MacBook Pro A2337 laptop,  
16 SN# FVFFH9QMQ6L5.

17 2. Kaminsky’s Expert shall maintain the complete original, unaltered,  
18 forensically sound image or preservation copy of the Kaminsky Device in segregated  
19 duplicate in a secure facility they operate and, except as directed otherwise by this  
20 Protocol, by joint stipulation of the Parties or by order of the Court, shall retain  
21 custody of the forensically sound image or preservation copy of the Kaminsky  
22 Device until the litigation has come to an end (i.e., the case has been dismissed or  
23 final judgment has been rendered and all appeal rights have been exhausted).  
24  
25

26 3. Costs and expenses incurred by Kaminsky’s Expert shall be the sole  
27 responsibility of Mr. Kaminsky.  
28

1 **DISCOVERY**

2 4. As soon as practicable, and no later than seven business days following  
3 the execution of this Protocol, Kaminsky's Expert shall deliver the materials and  
4 information described in paragraphs 5-9 of this Protocol via secure FTP to Move's  
5 forensic expert ("Move's Expert") by e-mail transmission to  
6 Matthew.Moore@thinkbrg.com and AShiflett@thinkbrg.com.

7 5. Kaminsky's Expert shall run Magnet Axiom or a similar product across  
8 the forensic image of the Kaminsky Device and produce reports for each category  
9 Magnet Axiom finds in Excel format (e.g. Google Searches, Chrome Internet  
10 History, Quick Look Thumbnails, etc.). Kaminsky's Expert shall exclude any  
11 categories that could contain the content of user documents or emails that could be  
12 privileged, including "Excel Documents," "Gmail Fragments," or "iChat  
13 Messages," and provide a list of the suppressed categories as part of the privilege  
14 log described in paragraph 6.

15 6. In the Magnet Axiom reports that are produced that potentially reflect  
16 private or privileged information (including but not limited to email and text  
17 histories, Google Searches and browser histories), Mr. Kaminsky may withhold data  
18 that (1) predates January 10, 2024, or (2) post-dates January 10, 2024, but which  
19 relates exclusively to Mr. Kaminsky's private matters such as family health. For the  
20 avoidance of doubt, Mr. Kaminsky shall still produce all Magnet Axiom or similar  
21 reports reflecting information (including internet search histories) that post-dates  
22 January 10, 2024 and which relate to Move, CoStar, accessing Google Docs, file  
23 deletion, or any of the facts or issues raised in the complaint and answer, along with  
24 a log of withheld information, stating the reason why the particular search is being  
25 withheld.

26 7. Kaminsky's Expert shall also provide acquisition information for the  
27 Kaminsky Device, including the make, model, serial number, imaging date, and hash  
28 value of the created forensic image of the Kaminsky Device.

1           8.     Kaminsky's Expert shall also generate a report listing how many APFS  
2 snapshots exist on the disk and the date of each. If none exist, Kaminsky's Expert  
3 shall provide a short statement to that effect.

4           9.     Kaminsky's Expert shall also produce a list of files and folders  
5 contained in the forensic image of the Kaminsky Device via Cellebrite Inspector.  
6 The list shall be generated in the Browser tab "Save File Listing" option, to csv  
7 format. CSVs shall not be split based on size. All fields shall be produced,  
8 including:

- 9                   (a) File Path
- 10                   (b) File Name
- 11                   (c) File Size
- 12                   (d) Date Created
- 13                   (e) Date Modified
- 14                   (f) Date Accessed
- 15                   (g) Date Added
- 16                   (h) MD5 Hash
- 17                   (i) All Spotlight metadata

18           10.    Within ten business days after providing the information described in  
19 paragraphs 5-9, Kaminsky's Expert shall also provide Move's Expert with the  
20 following artifacts, including data with folder structure in DMG format and  
21 Cellebrite Inspector for the export. These artifacts can be provided via secure FTP  
22 to the e-mail addresses listed in paragraph 4:

- 23                   (a) All non-UGD files containing these strings in the names:
  - 24                           (i)     MicrosoftRegistrationDb
  - 25                           (ii)    .bash\_history
  - 26                           (iii)   .zsh\_history
  - 27                           (iv)   com.apple.TimeMachine.plist
  - 28                           (v)    .AppleSetupDone

(vi) InstallHistory.plist

(b) All non-UGD files containing these strings in the paths:

(i) .zsh

(ii) com.apple.QuickLook.thumbnailcache

(iii) .fsevents

(iv) private\var\log (include any container file types that exist in this directory so long as those containers do not contain UGD)

(v) private\var\db\uuidtext

(vi) private\var\db\diagnostics

(vii) private\var\spool

(viii) Library\Preferences

(ix) Library\Logs

(x) .Spotlight-v100

(xi) .bash\_sessions

11. If Kaminsky's Expert determines (with the aid of Kaminsky's counsel) that artifacts listed in paragraphs 10(a)-10(b) would, if produced, risk disclosing personal (for example, health) or attorney-client privileged information, Kaminsky's Expert shall withhold those artifacts in the first instance and produce a log of the withheld artifacts, stating the reason why the particular artifact is being withheld.

12. Kaminsky's Expert shall also withhold from the transmittal to Move's Expert all underlying Microsoft Office files, pdfs, photos, videos, and other files containing audio-visual content on the Kaminsky Device.

13. Once Move's Expert has reviewed the full file listing and reports, Move will have the right to request specific files and/or artifacts for further forensic examination.

14. Mr. Kaminsky will then have five business days to either object to Move's request or produce the requested underlying files or artifacts. If Mr.

1 Kaminsky fails or refuses to do so, or if either Party determines that a dispute over  
2 an objection pursuant to this Protocol cannot be resolved, the Parties have the right  
3 to seek assistance from the Court within one business day, according to the operative  
4 civil procedures for discovery disputes.

5 15. The Parties agree that the provision of the Forensic Images as described  
6 herein shall not constitute a waiver of any claim of attorney-client privilege, work  
7 product protection, or any other protection against disclosure, or any rights to claw  
8 back or to confidentiality under the Confidentiality Protective Order or otherwise.  
9 The Parties further agree that nothing in this stipulation shall constitute a waiver of  
10 Move's right to challenge an assertion of privilege or work product by Mr. Kaminsky  
11 or to challenge a designation under the Confidentiality Protective Order pursuant to  
12 its terms.

13 16. The Parties further agree that nothing in this stipulated Protocol is a  
14 waiver of Move's rights and protections under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26  
15 concerning the exchange of expert information and reports. Moreover, compliance  
16 with this Protocol will not be deemed as a waiver of any work product or attorney-  
17 client privilege protections for retained experts' communications with counsel or  
18 those experts' drafts of reports.

19 Dated: January 15, 2025

JENNER & BLOCK LLP

20  
21 By: /s/ Todd C. Toral

22 Todd C. Toral

23 Brent Caslin

24 David R. Singer

25 Carolyn Small

26 Elizabeth Baldrige

27 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*  
28

1  
2 Dated: January 15, 2025

BROWN NERI SMITH KHAN LLP

3  
4 By: /s/ Ethan J. Brown

Ethan J. Brown

5 Patricia A. E. Tenenbaum

6 *Attorneys for Defendant*

7 *James Kaminsky*